Insight Blog

Keeping Score: Using a Hiring Rubric

October 22, 2019 by Nicole E. Zeller (Blog%2DAuthor%2DNicole%2DE%2DZeller)

14



A professional hired for a leadership role will interact with people of different levels and functions within an organization; therefore, organizations often form search committees and/or hiring teams to mirror this variety during the hiring process and to prevent the potential bias of a single hiring manager. When evaluating candidates collectively, it is imperative that all parties understand the hiring criteria, which should be documented in writing and referred to often. An effective search committee or hiring team will evaluate candidates on objective measures rather than subjective and will allow every member the opportunity to contribute feedback.

A hiring rubric is a scoring tool that defines the expectations by which each candidate will be evaluated. By using a

hiring rubric, also known as a hiring matrix or hiring scorecard, each person—whether dominant or reserved in group discussions—can participate equally in assessing candidates. A rubric is important because it helps to determine who will be interviewed, invited to interview again, and ultimately presented with an offer of employment. For this reason, search committees or hiring teams may implement an applicant screening rubric as well as an interview rubric.

The follow recommendations outline how to implement a hiring rubric to capture feedback about candidates throughout the hiring process.

When screening applicant resumes, the search committee or hiring team usually determines the minimum qualifications for a candidate's education and experience. As these questions warrant "yes or no" answers, it is best to assign a numerical value to each answer.

Each member then completes a rubric, which is typically an Excel spreadsheet, and submits it to a neutral third party (such as an administrative professional at your organization or an executive search firm) to compile candidate scores and provide a summary of responses. Candidates with the highest average scores are invited to interview.

APPLICANT SCREENING RUBRIC 5 = Yes, 2.5 = Maybe, 0 = No
Role
Committee Member Name

	Candidate 1	Candidate 2	Candidate 3
Candidate Last Name	Smith		
Candidate First Name	John		
Employer	University of Texas		
Current Title	Director of Facilities		
Education: Bachelor's degree in related field. Yes or No?	5		
***Optional* feedback about Education:**	B.S. in Environmental Science		
Professional Certification: Yes or No?	0		
***Optional* feedback about Certification:**			
Experience: 10+ years of progressive work experience. Yes or No?	5		
***Optional* feedback about Experience:**	Has 12 years of experience		
Recommend for an interview: Yes, Maybe or No?	2.5		
***Optional* feedback about Recommendation:**			
Total Score	**12.5**		

To assess candidate responses during an interview, it is common to use a numerical scale like this on an interview rubric:
(1) Unsatisfactory (2) Below Average (3) Average (4) Above Average (5) Exceptional

Interview questions should pertain to traits or factors that can be evaluated, such as: cultural fit, career motivation, social skills, teamwork, technical skills, leadership capabilities, critical thinking/problem solving, and, self-awareness.

INTERVIEW RUBRIC						
POSITION TITLE						
INTERVIEWER'S NAME		DATE				
Scale =	1 – Unsatisfactory	2 – Below Average	3 – Average	4 – Above Average	5 – Exceptional	
FACTORS	Candidates					
	James	Aliyah	Michael	Marie	Steven	Sample Questions
Cultural Fit	4	5	4	3	5	How would you describe your ideal organizational structure? What attributes of an institution's culture do you value?
Career Motivation	2	5	4	5	5	Why is our organization and its role attractive to you? What are your short- and long-term career goals?
Social Skills	3	4	3	4	4	Which personality traits do you value in the workplace? Are there behaviors or attitudes that you particularly like or dislike?
Teamwork	4	4	2	5	5	How do you build rapport with colleagues, direct reports and your manager? Describe the relationships you have with them.
Technical Skills	3	4	5	4	5	TBD by role.
Leadership Capabilities	5	4	3	5	4	What experience do you have in hiring and training staff? How do you maintain positivity in the workplace?
Critical Thinking / Problem Solving	4	3	5	3	5	Tell me about a time when you identified a problem and describe your role in the solution.
Self-Awareness	4	2	4	5	5	Describe your strengths and how you leverage them. Describe your weaknesses and how you improve upon them. How would your colleagues describe you?
AVERAGE SCORE	3.625	3.875	3.750	4.250	4.750	

(/Files/Admin/Blog/InterviewRubric.JPG)

While easy to derive an average score after ranking a candidate on each factor, what if the search committee or hiring team wants to prioritize certain factors? You can weight them by assigning a percentage to each factor providing that the total is 100 percent. In the example below, note how the weighted average score for each candidate compares to the original average score.

Much like the applicant screening process, each member of the committee or team completes a rubric following the interviews and submits it to a third party to compile the scores for each candidate and provide an average of responses. Candidates with the highest scores are interviewed another time or presented with an offer of employment.

INTERVIEW RUBRIC - WEIGHTED FACTORS							
POSITION TITLE							
INTERVIEWER'S NAME			DATE				
	Scale =	1 – Unsatisfactory	2 – Below Average	3 – Average	4 – Above Average	5 – Exceptional	
FACTORS	Weight	Candidates					
		James	Aliyah	Michael	Marie	Steven	Sample Questions
Cultural Fit	20%	4	5	4	3	5	How would you describe your ideal organizational structure? What attributes of an institution's culture do you value?
Career Motivation	5%	2	5	4	5	5	Why is our organization and its role attractive to you? What are your short- and long-term career goals?
Social Skills	10%	3	4	3	4	4	Which personality traits do you value in the workplace? Are there behaviors or attitudes that you particularly like or dislike?
Teamwork	10%	4	4	2	5	5	How do you build rapport with colleagues, direct reports and your manager? Describe the relationships you have with them.
Technical Skills	20%	3	4	5	4	5	TBD by role.
Leadership Capabilities	15%	5	4	3	5	4	What experience do you have in hiring and training staff? How do you maintain positivity in the workplace?
Critical Thinking / Problem Solving	15%	4	3	5	3	5	Tell me about a time when you identified a problem and describe your role in the solution.
Self-Awareness	5%	4	2	4	5	5	Describe your strengths and how you leverage them. Describe your weaknesses and how you improve upon them. How would your colleagues describe you?
Weighted AVERAGE	**100%**	**3.750**	**4.000**	**3.900**	**4.000**	**4.750**	

(/Files/Admin/Blog/InterviewRubric_Weighted2.JPG)

When using hiring rubrics, feedback is recorded and stored in a central location and—most importantly—candidates are assessed efficiently, consistently, and objectively! To request formattable files of the examples presented, please contact Nicole Zeller (mailto:nicolez@helblingsearch.com?subject=Message%20from%20Hiring%20Rubric%20Blog).

14

applicant screening (blog?tag=applicant%20screening) | evaluating candidates (blog?tag=evaluating%20candidates) | hiring (blog?tag=hiring) | interviewing (blog?tag=interviewing) | recruitment (blog?tag=recruitment) | rubric (blog?tag=rubric)

You May Like

(Blog-Item-Chairing-a-Search-Committee-in-Higher-Education)